

CHARTER TOWNSHIP OF MERIDIAN  
TOWNSHIP BOARD REGULAR MEETING - **APPROVED** -  
5151 Marsh Road, Okemos, MI 48864-1198  
853-4000, Town Hall Room  
TUESDAY, APRIL 21, 2009 **6:00 P.M.**

PRESENT: Supervisor McGillicuddy, Clerk Helmbrecht, Treasurer Brixie, Trustees Dreyfus,  
LeGoff, Ochberg (6:07 P.M.), Veenstra (6:03 P.M.)  
ABSENT: None  
STAFF: Township Manager Gerald Richards, Director of Community Planning & Development  
Mark Kieselbach, Director of Engineering & Public Works Ray Severy, EMS/Fire Chief  
Fred Cowper, Attorney Andria Ditschman

1. CALL MEETING TO ORDER

Supervisor McGillicuddy called the meeting to order at 6:00 P.M.

2. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Supervisor McGillicuddy led the Pledge of Allegiance.

3. ROLL CALL

Supervisor McGillicuddy called the roll of the Board.

4. PUBLIC REMARKS

Supervisor McGillicuddy opened Public Remarks.

Marsha Madle, Chair, Economic Development 1373 Sebewaing, Okemos, reported the Economic Development Corporation met for a joint meeting with the Township Board, Meridian Area Business Association (MABA) Board and the Downtown Development Authority (DDA) Board on April 16, 2009. She indicated the primary discussion focused on action steps to address challenges in the Township identified at the previous joint meeting held in February (i.e., branding and informal roundtable discussions with two or three trustees and members of the business community).

Malinda Barr, President, MABA, PO Box 234, Okemos, noted three (3) tentative dates over the next six (6) weeks have been chosen for roundtable discussions. She added these dates, along with the three township business locations at which they will be held, will be e-mailed to Board members for participation selection. Ms. Barr indicated Trustee Dreyfus, Ms. Madle and she will have further discussion to finalize the agenda and agenda topics. She stated the MABA Board will discuss topics at its meeting on April 28, 2009 to ensure a mix of both government-based and business-desired topics.

Supervisor McGillicuddy closed Public Remarks.

5. REPORTS/BOARD COMMENT/NEW WORRIES

Treasurer Brixie announced the Pension Board meeting will be held Thursday, April 23, 2009 at 4:00 P.M. She attended the Joint EDC meeting and found the discussion on branding and economic prosperity in the Township to be very thorough and useful.

Clerk Helmbrecht announced the May 5<sup>th</sup> Election for the Haslett and Williamston School Districts at Precincts #1-5, 7, and 20.

Trustee Dreyfus reported his attendance at the last Cable Communications Commission meeting where use of HOM-TV facilities by various groups was discussed.

Trustee Veenstra reported his attendance at Tri-County Regional Planning Commission's Transportation Review Committee on April 15, 2009. He noted the committee approved the transit plan for all three transit authorities in order to spend federal grant money.

Supervisor McGillicuddy added that six (6) of the seven (7) Board members were in attendance at the Joint EDC Meeting held April 16, 2009.

Trustee Ochberg reported her attendance at the Joint EDC Meeting during which she volunteered to create a map with logos/signs of all Meridian Township businesses. As of this date, she noted she has drawn 205 logos and has not yet completed Okemos. Trustee Ochberg added that during the process, she took note of the large amount of vacant business buildings in the Township.

Manager Richards reminded citizens of the April 25, 2009 Recycling Event from 9:00 to 2:00 P.M. in the Meridian Municipal Building parking lot. He listed accepted items as follows: Paper and hardback books, all plastics, telephone books, clear and colored glass, polystyrene/Styrofoam products, pharmaceuticals (prescription and non-prescription) and veterinary medicines.

Supervisor McGillicuddy announced the Green Star acknowledgement for 76 businesses in Meridian Township who participate in commercial recycling.

6. APPROVAL OF AGENDA — OR CHANGES

**Treasurer Brixie moved to approve the agenda amended as follows:**

- **Removal of Agenda Item #5A – Lake Lansing Presentation by Chair Larry Wagenknecht, Lake Lansing Advisory Committee**

**Seconded by Trustee Dreyfus.**

VOICE VOTE: Motion carried unanimously.

7. CONSENT AGENDA

Supervisor McGillicuddy reviewed the consent agenda.

**Treasurer Brixie moved to adopt the Consent Agenda. Seconded by Trustee Ochberg.**

ROLL CALL VOTE: YEAS: Trustees Dreyfus, LeGoff, Ochberg, Veenstra, Supervisor McGillicuddy, Clerk Helmbrecht, Treasurer Brixie

NAYS: None

Motion carried unanimously.

The adopted Consent Agenda items are as follow:

A. Communications

1). Board Information (BI)

BI-1 Craig Thiel, 676 Emily, Haslett; RE: Resignation from the Economic Development Corporation

(2). Regional Linkage (RL)

RL-1 G. Lawrence Merrill, Executive Director, Michigan Townships Association, 512 Westshire Drive, Lansing; RE: Response to HOM-TV request for additional financial support in the lawsuit against Comcast relative to moving PEG channels to the second tier

RL-2 James M. Benjamin, Director of Operations, Ingham County Road Commission (ICRC), 301 Bush Street, Mason; RE: Introduction as new Director of Operations for the ICRC

(3). Staff Communication/Referral (SC)

SC-1 Martha K. Wyatt, Assistant Planner/Landscape Architect; RE: Commission Review #09023

(4). On File in the Clerk's Office (OF)

Capital Area Transportation Authority, 4615 Tranter Street, Lansing; RE: Transmittal of CATA's 2008 Annual Report

Material received at the April 7, 2009 Board Meeting

Cecilia Kramer, Ingham County Drain Commissioner's Office, PO Box 220, Mason; RE: Information relative to the possible repeal of Michigan's Wetland Protection Act

**Treasurer Brixie moved that the communications be received and placed on file, and any communications not already assigned for disposition be referred to the Township Manager or Supervisor for follow-up. Seconded by Trustee Ochberg.**

ROLL CALL VOTE: YEAS: Trustees Dreyfus, LeGoff, Ochberg, Veenstra, Supervisor McGillicuddy, Clerk Helmbrecht, Treasurer Brixie  
NAYS: None  
Motion carried unanimously.

B. Minutes

**Treasurer Brixie moved to approve and ratify the minutes of the April 7, 2009 Regular Meeting as submitted. Seconded by Trustee Ochberg.**

ROLL CALL VOTE: YEAS: Trustees Dreyfus, LeGoff, Ochberg, Veenstra, Supervisor McGillicuddy, Clerk Helmbrecht, Treasurer Brixie  
NAYS: None  
Motion carried unanimously.

C. Bills

**Treasurer Brixie moved that the Township Board approve the Manager's Bills as follows:**

Common Cash	\$ 198,403.97
Public Works	\$ 348,959.41
Total Checks	\$ 547,363.38
Credit Card Transactions	\$ 7,804.02
Total Purchases	<u>\$ 555,167.40</u>
ACH Payments	<u>\$ 396,443.19</u>

**Seconded by Trustee Ochberg.**

ROLL CALL VOTE: YEAS: Trustees Dreyfus, LeGoff, Ochberg, Veenstra, Supervisor McGillicuddy, Clerk Helmbrecht, Treasurer Brixie  
NAYS: None  
Motion carried unanimously.

[Bill list in Official Minute Book]

D. Assessing Stipulation

**Treasurer Brixie moved that the Township Assessor be authorized to sign a stipulation with Budd A.M., on the following property:**

<u>YEAR</u>	<u>DOCKET NO.</u>	<u>ADDRESS OF PROPERTY</u>
2008	0347739	4750 Central Park Drive, Okemos
<u>Assessment</u>	2008 <u>AV/TV</u>	\$1,776,000/1,624,894
<u>Proposed Assessment</u>	2008 <u>AV/TV</u>	\$1,400,000/1,400,000

**Seconded by Trustee Ochberg.**

ROLL CALL VOTE: YEAS: Trustees Dreyfus, LeGoff, Ochberg, Veenstra, Supervisor  
McGillicuddy, Clerk Helmbrecht, Treasurer Brixie  
NAYS: None  
Motion carried unanimously.

- E. Appointments to the Community Resources Commission  
**Treasurer Brixie moved that Marian Frane and Carla Maxine Neuman be appointed to fill the vacant positions on the Community Resources Commission for the terms to expire December 31, 2009 and December 31, 2010. Seconded by Trustee Ochberg.**

ROLL CALL VOTE: YEAS: Trustees Dreyfus, LeGoff, Ochberg, Veenstra, Supervisor  
McGillicuddy, Clerk Helmbrecht, Treasurer Brixie  
NAYS: None  
Motion carried unanimously.

- F. Student Appointment to the Environmental Commission  
**Treasurer Brixie moved that Laura Donahue be appointed to the Environmental Commission as a non-voting, ex-officio student member for a term ending December 31, 2009. Seconded by Trustee Ochberg.**

ROLL CALL VOTE: YEAS: Trustees Dreyfus, LeGoff, Ochberg, Veenstra, Supervisor  
McGillicuddy, Clerk Helmbrecht, Treasurer Brixie  
NAYS: None  
Motion carried unanimously.

- G. Reappointments to Lake Lansing Advisory Committee  
**Treasurer Brixie moved that the following property owners be appointed to the Lake Lansing Watershed Advisory Committee for terms expiring April 30, 2011: Robert Hollenshead, 6068 Columbia,; Helen Shipley, 6369 W. Reynolds; Larry Wagenknecht, 6097 Partridge. Seconded by Trustee Ochberg.**

ROLL CALL VOTE: YEAS: Trustees Dreyfus, LeGoff, Ochberg, Veenstra, Supervisor  
McGillicuddy, Clerk Helmbrecht, Treasurer Brixie  
NAYS: None  
Motion carried unanimously.

- H. Resolution Establishing Election Receiving Boards  
**Treasurer Brixie moved [and read into the record] NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that the Township Board of the Charter Township of Meridian hereby authorizes the appointment of Receiving Boards for each election conducted in the Township beginning May 1, 2009 through May 1, 2010. Seconded by Trustee Ochberg.**

ROLL CALL VOTE: YEAS: Trustees Dreyfus, LeGoff, Ochberg, Veenstra, Supervisor  
McGillicuddy, Clerk Helmbrecht, Treasurer Brixie  
NAYS: None  
Motion carried unanimously.

8. QUESTIONS FOR THE ATTORNEY

9. HEARINGS

- A. Champion Woods Streetlighting Improvements (continued), Special Assessment District #322  
Supervisor McGillicuddy opened the public hearing at 6:13 P.M.  
Director Severy summarized the proposed special assessment district as outlined in staff memorandum dated April 17, 2009.

Supervisor McGillicuddy closed the public hearing at 6:14 P.M.

- B. Jolly Oak Road Public Road Improvements (continued), Special Assessment District #36  
Supervisor McGillicuddy opened the public hearing at 6:14 P.M.  
Director Severy summarized the proposed special assessment district as outlined in staff memorandum dated April 17, 2009.

Supervisor McGillicuddy closed the public hearing at 6:15 P.M.

10. ACTION ITEMS/ENDS

Supervisor McGillicuddy opened and closed public comment.

- A. Champion Woods Streetlighting Improvements, Special Assessment District #322  
**Treasurer Brixie moved to approve the Champion Woods Public Streetlighting Improvements Special Assessment District #322 - Resolution #5, which approves the final special assessment roll, adopts the amount of \$5,191.10 as the first year assessment and the amount of \$2,875.00 (subject to adjustment) as the annual assessment thereafter, and authorizes the Clerk and the Supervisor to sign the Authorization for Change in Streetlighting Contract as prepared by Consumers Energy Company. Seconded by Supervisor McGillicuddy.**

ROLL CALL VOTE: YEAS: Trustees Dreyfus, LeGoff, Ochberg, Veenstra, Supervisor McGillicuddy, Clerk Helmbrecht, Treasurer Brixie  
NAYS: None  
Motion carried unanimously.

- B. Jolly Oak Road Public Road Improvements, Special Assessment District #36  
**Clerk Helmbrecht moved to approve the Jolly Oak Road Public Road Improvements Special Assessment District No. 36 Resolution No. 5, which approves the special assessment roll; designates the project as “Jolly Oak Road Public Road Improvements Special Assessment District No. 36”, the assessment roll as the “Jolly Oak Road Public Road Improvements Special Assessment District No. 36 Special Assessment Roll”, and the district as the “Jolly Oak Road Public Road Improvements Special Assessment District No. 36”; adopts the amount of \$417,000.00 as the final amount for the assessment roll; and orders and directs the assessment roll to be paid and collected. Seconded by Treasurer Brixie.**

ROLL CALL VOTE: YEAS: Trustees Dreyfus, LeGoff, Ochberg, Veenstra, Supervisor McGillicuddy, Clerk Helmbrecht, Treasurer Brixie  
NAYS: None  
Motion carried unanimously.

- C. Wetland Use Permit 09-01 (Delta Dental), request to fill and excavate wetlands for expansion and redesign of a pond and to construct parking spaces at 4100 Okemos Road  
**Treasurer Brixie moved [and read into the record] NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THE TOWNSHIP BOARD OF THE CHARTER TOWNSHIP OF MERIDIAN, pursuant to Article 4 of Section 22 of the Township Code of Ordinances, hereby approves Wetland Use Permit #09-01 with the following conditions:**

1. **Approval is based upon the wetland use permit plans prepared by Spicer Group, Inc. and the mitigation plans prepared by Environmental Consulting & Technology, Inc. received by the Township on March 6, 2009; stormwater calculations and plans prepared by Spicer Group, Inc. received by the Township on March 23, 2009; as well as the documents and materials submitted by the applicant in conjunction with Wetland Use Permit #09-01, subject to revisions as required.**

2. **The applicant shall obtain all necessary permits, licenses, and approvals from the Township and the Ingham County Drain Commissioner's office prior to construction. Copies of all permits, licenses, and approvals shall be forwarded to the Department of Community Planning and Development.**
3. **A variance from the Zoning Board of Appeals shall be obtained prior to construction of the portion of the bridge within the water features setback.**
4. **The wetland boundary for Wetland B and Wetland D (Township Wetland #28-4) shall be flagged prior to the start of construction related to the wetland use permit. The flagging shall be clearly evident throughout construction.**
5. **The applicant shall ensure all appropriate soil erosion and sedimentation control best management practices are installed and maintained until natural stabilizing vegetation has been established.**
6. **Prior to construction, erosion control fencing shall be installed to prevent sedimentation from infiltrating into the wetlands. The installation and location of the erosion control fencing shall be subject to the approval of the Director of Community Planning and Development. The erosion control fencing shall be removed after completion of the project and the area is stabilized.**
7. **No straw bales shall be used for erosion control, unless in conjunction with sediment erosion control fencing.**
8. **The bypass channel shall have routine monitoring before and after flow is established to ensure bank and bed erosion does not occur and carry sediment downstream.**
9. **The stormwater discharge point proposed at the east end of the pond shall be stabilized with stone riprap.**
10. **The slopes of the two spoils areas located south of Wetland B and Wetland D shall be stabilized immediately with annual grasses, and shall be closely monitored for movement of soil toward the wetland buffers, especially along the steeper slopes near Wetland B.**
11. **Prior to the start of construction related to the wetland use permit, a performance guarantee in the amount of \$10,000 shall be provided in an acceptable form to the Township to ensure completion of the wetland mitigation.**
12. **The activities impacting the wetlands and construction of the mitigation areas shall be overseen by the applicant's wetland consultant throughout the process. Deviations from the approved mitigation plan shall be first reviewed and approved by the Director of Community Planning and Development.**
13. **Plants for the mitigation areas shall be obtained from the most genetically proximate source practical.**
14. **The wetland mitigation areas shall be monitored annually by the applicant's wetland consultant for five years with a written status report and photographic documentation provided to the Township each year. The Township's Environmental Consultant shall be included in the applicant's September monitoring.**

15. The ten sample plots in Mitigation Area A and three in Mitigation Area B shall be permanently staked during the first monitoring season. In addition, transects shall be established in each of the five areas of Area A and one in Area B. Vegetative assessments along each transect shall include a 0.5 meter wide vegetative assessment along each transect, identifying the percentage of coverage per species and the percentage of coverage of bare ground.
16. Should the mitigation areas fail to establish wetland vegetation after one growing season, or fail to progress satisfactorily to a self-sustaining wetland as designed, the applicant shall conduct corrective measures as directed by the Township's Environmental Consultant to ensure successful wetland establishment.
17. Prior to the start of construction related to the wetland use permit, the applicant shall provide to the Department of Community Planning and Development written notice of commencement.
18. The applicant shall notify the Township once the following portions of the project have been completed to allow for inspection prior to proceeding:
  - After installation of the sheet pile barrier, construction of the bypass channel and placement of the fabric in the channel.
  - Immediately after establishing flow in the bypass channel.
  - After construction of the wetland shelf is completed in Wetland A, but prior to planting.
  - After the two spoils areas south of Wetland B and Wetland D have been stabilized and seeded.
  - After construction of Mitigation Area B, but prior to planting.
19. The applicant shall notify the Department of Community Planning and Development when construction related to the wetland use permit has been completed so the site can be inspected to ensure compliance.
20. A copy of the approved wetland use permit containing the conditions of issuance shall be posted on the site in a conspicuous manner such that the wording of the permit is available for public inspection. Posting of the site shall be done prior to commencement of work on the site and continue throughout the duration of the project.

Seconded by Trustee Veenstra.

Board members discussed the following:

- Adequate protection of the wetlands through conditions placed in the approval
- Suggestion to change language in condition #16 to have the Director of Community Planning and Development conduct corrective measures with the advice of the Township's Environmental Consultant

ROLL CALL VOTE: YEAS: Trustees Dreyfus, LeGoff, Ochberg, Veenstra, Supervisor McGillicuddy, Clerk Helmbrecht, Treasurer Brixie  
NAYS: None  
Motion carried unanimously.

11. DISCUSSION ITEMS/ENDS

Supervisor McGillicuddy opened and closed public comment.

A. CATA Redi-Ride Service and Millage

Capital Area Transportation Authority (CATA) Assistant Director Debbie Alexander summarized the history of CATA Redi-Ride Service in Meridian Township over the last ten (10) years and spoke to the possible millage renewal.

Board members and Ms. Alexander discussed the following:

- Redi-Ride service at capacity
- Ridership: 13.7% are seniors; 41.4% are persons with disabilities; 34% are students; 11% are others
- Spec-Tran is a service which requires the rider be certified (certification guided by the American with Disabilities Act)
- Spec-Tran is provided anywhere in any funded CATA service area
- Redi-Ride is open to the general public and must have a destination to and from designations within Meridian Township
- Use of Redi-Ride to transport students to and from school
- CATA not allowed by state law to determine trip purposes
- CATA publications indicate Redi-Ride not to be used if public school transportation service is available to the student for the same trip
- Belief that Redi-Ride used by students is a hidden tax for educational purposes
- Redi-Ride is an overt tax on citizens
- Primary users are individuals with disabilities which could use Spec Tran
- Concern that private costs are being shifted to taxpayers
- In favor of expanding the hours of service from 8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m. specifically to help parents transport their children to school
- .231 mills to expand hours of operation from 8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m.
- Regular adult fare is \$1.25 per trip
- Regular fare for students, seniors and disabled is \$.60 per trip
- Curb side services not available in most cities and a luxury in Meridian Township
- Spec-Tran cost is \$2.50 per trip
- Real cost per passenger in 2009 is \$16.11
- CATA base millage of 2.22 mills will expire in 2010
- Spec-Tran is partially paid for out of the base millage and partially paid for out of the county-wide millage levied by Ingham County
- Addition last year of .787 mills
- Addition of .01 mills would bring the Redi-Ride millage rate to .21 mills
- .21 mills necessary to continue service at its current level without expansion of hours
- Belief that language needs to be clear regarding Headlee reduction and need for an increase in order to maintain service at current levels
- Possible change in Redi-Ride service from 8:00 AM to 5:00 PM Monday through Friday would constitute a three-hour savings
- Cost to the Township in placing the question on the ballot dependent upon when it is asked
- Once a governmental entity places an item on the ballot, a majority of the costs for school elections is paid for by the participating governmental entities
- Not economically wise to ask residents to renew Redi-Ride millage at this time
- Majority of the Board in favor of placing Redi-Ride Service renewal on the ballot
- Request for CATA to supply total Redi-Ride ridership by day
- Placement of millage renewal on for the November election
- Duration of the millage renewal for ten (10) years
- Decrease in ridership from 2007 to 2008 due to demand exceeding the ability to provide service
- Need to keep ridership "flat" because receiving the same amount of money through millage renewal will not allow for expansion of service or capacity
- Several assumptions were made in order to provide financials to the Board
- Prerogative of the Township to set the fare for Redi-Ride
- Spec-Tran required by federal law to meet ridership demand
- Prior to passage of original Redi-Ride millage in Meridian Township, Spec-Tran provided all services in Meridian Township for persons with disabilities
- Cost per passenger for Spec-Tran similar to cost per passenger for Redi-Ride
- CATA does not have grants available to them to assist Meridian Township with placing the Redi-Ride renewal on the ballot

**The consensus of the Board was to place the millage renewal proposal on the November ballot at .2 mills for ten years.**

B. Alaiedon Township EMS/Fire Agreement

Manager Richards summarized a proposed EMS/Fire Agreement with Alaiedon Township as outlined in staff memorandum dated April 17, 2009.

Board members and staff discussed the following:

- Jackson National Life (JNL) reimburses Meridian Township for EMS runs
- EMS “services” cost more than just run charge: staffing, etc.
- Suggestion that Meridian Township serve both the residential and business district south of Jolly Road and north of I-96 expressway as a future discussion item
- Suggestion that JNL contribute its portion of Meridian Township’s police/fire millage the same as other businesses in the township
- Preference to focus discussion at this time on providing Jackson National Life with EMS/Fire services
- Structure EMS/Fire Agreement the same as agreements with other governmental entities
- Ingham County Board of Commissioners discussion to drop sheriff’s services in other townships
- Proposed Alaiedon Township EMS/Fire Agreement is a First Responder Agreement

**The consensus of the Board was to have the Township Manager present a proposed agreement to the Board at a future meeting.**

C. National Citizen Survey, Optional Questions

Manager Richards summarized the revised questions to be included in the 2009 National Citizen Survey as outlined in staff memorandum dated April 17, 2009.

Board members and staff discussed the following:

- Additional cost of \$550 to include a fourth question on economic development
- Proposal to eliminate the form of government question and place economic development in its place
- Suggestion to remove the consolidation of three existing fire stations from the Central Fire Station survey question
- First question on community gardening should be the question of personal interest in maintaining a plot in a community garden
- Applying for federal and state economic development grants is good business practice and not needed on the survey
- Responses will be measured through a continuum of levels of support for a question
- Opinion that the question on the importance of economic development to the long-term viability of the Township will not aid the Township Board in its decision making processes
- Need to keep form of government question as the makeup of the Township has changed over the years since the question was previously asked
- Addition of question (b) for form of government: Being a city would allow Meridian to repair and design our roads. Would you be in favor?
- Need to keep the consolidation of three existing fire stations question on the survey to provide residents with informational options
- Community garden question (a) relative to the use of Township owned land requires the Township to expend funds so question needs to state “Use of Township-owned land and funds”
- Community garden question discussed by the Board a few years ago included school, apartment and condominium association locations, not just Township owned land
- Board needs to ascertain through the survey questions that they are working on projects which the community thinks are “their” priorities
- Clarification that the Township will expend some tax money regardless of the property used for a community garden
- Possible economic development question regarding redevelopment of older structures
- Possible economic development question asking if the resident owns a home business in the township

- Possible economic development question asking if the resident owns a business in the Township would not give an accurate assessment of the number of businesses in the Township
- Economic development question on live-work housing not currently offered in the Township
- Additional demographic questions at the end of the survey relative to age, gender, income, etc.
- Consensus to make fourth bullet point language more explanatory in the Central Fire Station survey question
- Consensus to insert “and funds” after “Township-owned land” in (a), move question (d) to (a), change language in (b) from “tax dollars” to “funds”, insert “on non-Township owned land” after “projects” in (b) for community gardening question
- Delete third bullet in (b), add “Is the Township getting in the way of economic development?” for the economic development question
- Suggestion for MABA and the EDC to review new question language for economic development
- Inclusion of question on owning a business in Meridian Township in the demographic section on the survey

**The consensus of the Board was to include the economic prosperity question at an additional charge and direct the Manager to make final changes for the proposed survey questions.**

D. Township Legal Services Agreement

Manager Richards summarized the contract renewal for legal services with the current Township Attorney as outlined in staff memorandum dated April 17, 2009.

Board members discussed the following:

- Personnel and labor relations is a specialized field of law
- Township use of a specialized labor attorney
- Large percentage of employment and personnel matters is billed at an hourly rate
- Township has seldom used counsel for press releases and news conferences
- Necessity of the attorney’s attendance at Board meetings
- Reduction in attorney’s attendance at Board meetings dependent upon subject matter on the agenda
- Hourly billing may incur more attorney fees than retainer agreement
- Average number of requests submitted to the law firm by type of request
- Retainer of \$11,000 per month equates to a yearly cost of \$132,000
- Total costs of approximately \$250,000 to \$280,000 per year for Township Attorney
- Benefits of a retainer is that the attorney knows the subject matter, the Board knows they will get their questions answered and the Board, if they have any doubt about getting the question answered, will ask the question because it is part of the retainer
- Lack of a retainer will necessitate the Board looking at the cost prior to asking the question
- Retainer has increased \$1,000 per month over the last eight (8) years
- Approximate total legal fees, including legal firm which enforces mostly traffic ordinances and the Comcast lawsuit, is approximately \$400,000
- As revenues may decline, one area to cut costs is the reduction of the attorney’s attendance at Board meetings
- Ask questions of the attorney prior to the meeting
- Combination of retainer and hourly billing is the most economical
- 96 hours contained in the retainer agreement for attorney attendance at Board meetings is approximately ½ of the yearly total hours the Board meets
- First contract with the \$10,000 per month retainer fee for the current law firm included all district court issues
- Retainer may not have increased dramatically over the years, but the level of service with the current law firm has decreased
- No RFPs will be taken

**The consensus of the Board was to reduce the attorney's attendance at Board meetings, eliminate 2i. regarding employment and personnel matters and 2k. regarding press releases and news conferences, and keep the retainer in the agreement.**

12. PUBLIC REMARKS

Supervisor McGillicuddy opened Public Remarks.

Ganesh Reddy, 3614 Ponderosa Drive, Okemos, requested the Board follow standard government practice and bid out the legal services contract. He urged the Board to make the cost for legal services public.

Supervisor McGillicuddy closed Public Remarks.

13. FINAL BOARD COMMENT

Trustee Ochberg reminded citizens that the relationship between an attorney and client is one of trust. She indicated there is no reason not to negotiate with the existing Township legal services firm.

14. ADJOURNMENT

Supervisor McGillicuddy adjourned the meeting at 8:25 P.M.

---

SUSAN MCGILLICUDDY  
TOWNSHIP SUPERVISOR

---

MARY M. G. HELMBRECHT, CMC  
TOWNSHIP CLERK

Sandra K. Otto, Secretary